ARIZONA STATE
PSYCHIATRIC SECURITY REVIEW BOARD
OPEN SESSION MINUTES
May 31, 2019
PSRB Hearing Room
2500 E. Van Buren St.
Phoenix, AZ  85008

Members:
James P. Clark, M.D., Chairperson
Chandrika Shankar, M.D., Vice-Chairperson
Susan Stevens, Esq.
Paul O’Connell, M.S., M.P.A. ☹
Michael J. Klemens, Ph.D. ☺
☺ Absent
☺ Absent from 1:33 p.m. to 2:05 p.m.

Assistant Attorney General:
Thomas Raine, Esq., for the Psychiatric Security Review Board

Staff:
Jaime L. Shapiro, Executive Director

Guests Present and/or Participating:
Aliyah Marsh ☏
Barbara LeBourdais
Benjamin Brewer, Esq. ☏
Caleb Marsh ☏
Cheryl Robinson
Christopher Fortier
Clayton Smith
Cole Arigoni, Mercy Care
Colton Peltier, ASH
Danette Cox

David Joslyn, ASH
Diane Wagner, ASH
Dolores Chavez ☏
Emil Osipav
Emmanuel Lee, Jr. ☏
Faheem Baki, ASH
Gabriela Reyes, ASH
Gary Stout ☏
Greg Norton ☏
Marta Taylor ☏
Call To Order:
James Clark called the meeting to order at 1:02 p.m. and read the Executive Session Confidentiality Statement:

“Minutes of and discussions made in executive session are required by law to be kept confidential and shall not be communicated to any person outside this meeting room, except to members of the Board, a person who is the subject of the discussion pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) § 38-431.03(A)(1), the auditor general in connection with an audit authorized by law, and the attorney general.”

Dr. Clark swore in individuals who anticipated testifying.

Statutory Hearings:
Ricky Allen Yazzie – PSRB No. 14-13
Ricky Yazzie was present in person and through counsel, Roberta McVickers, who appeared telephonically. The statutory hearing was held from 1:09 p.m. to 1:16 p.m. pursuant to A.R.S. § 13-3994(H). ASH recommended conditional release to ASH, phase three, levels five and six.
Roberta McVickers, Paul Galocher, and Michael Tunink were teleconferenced into the hearing.

Roberta McVickers, Defense Counsel, requested that the Board approve the recommendation. Michael Tunink, Coconino Deputy County Attorney, stated that the State is in favor of the most restrictive setting and opposes unsupervised passes for Mr. Yazzie citing a great risk to the public and an earlier incident involving a rifle. Paul Galocher stated he has been Mr. Yazzie’s AA sponsor for about 2.5 years and that Mr. Yazzie is committed to his recovery, and is rational and responsible in his decision making.

After discussion, a motion was made by James Clark, seconded by Susan Stevens, and passed 4 – 0 to approve Ricky Yazzie for conditional release to Arizona State Hospital, phase three, levels five and six, and amend the conditional release treatment plan so that 180 days must elapse prior to Mr. Yazzie being considered for level six, based on the evidence presented by the Arizona State Hospital’s treatment team, that Ricky Yazzie’s mental disease or defect is in stable remission and he is not dangerous if he remains a resident of the State Hospital and is compliant with the terms of conditional release and the treatment plan presented today.

Dolores Ruby Chavez – PSRB No. 01-12
Dolores Chavez was present telephonically and through counsel, Rebecca Johnson, who appeared telephonically. The statutory hearing was held from 1:23 p.m. to 1:26 p.m. pursuant to A.R.S. § 31-502(A)(5) and (B)(4). Ms. Chavez requested permission to change her residential address.

Dolores Chavez, Natalie Williams, and Rebecca Johnson were teleconferenced into the hearing.

After discussion, a motion was made by Susan Stevens, seconded by Chandrika Shankar, and passed 4 – 0 to approve the change of address and that all other conditions remain the same, based on the evidence presented that Ms. Chavez remains in stable remission and no longer dangerous.

Lane Joseph Roberts – PSRB No. 14-05
Lane Roberts was present in person and through counsel, Kennedy Klagge, who appeared telephonically. The statutory hearing was held from 1:29 p.m. to 1:33 p.m. pursuant to A.R.S. § 13-3994(F). This was an initial hearing and there was no recommendation at that time.
Kennedy Klagge, Gary Stout, and Marta Taylor were teleconferenced into the hearing.

Dr. Clark stated that Dr. Jaffe’s report lacks needed detail, particularly item four where it is discussed whether the patient still suffers from a mental disease or defect.

Kennedy Klagge, defense counsel, stated that Mr. Roberts has a good understanding of what he needs to do in order to be considered for privileges.

Gary Stout was sworn in and testified that Mr. Roberts was violent prior to the index crime, and is a danger if he is not medicated.

A motion was made by Susan Stevens, seconded by Chandrika Shankar, and passed 3 – 0 that the PSRB deny conditional release for Lane Roberts based on the evidence presented by the Arizona State Hospital’s treatment team, that Mr. Roberts did not prove by clear and convincing evidence that he no longer suffers from a mental disease or defect, that the mental disease or defect is in stable remission and that he is no longer dangerous. Lane Roberts shall remain committed to the Arizona State Hospital.

Michael Klemens was not present for the vote.

Christopher James Martell – PSRB No. 14-05
Christopher Martell was present in person and through counsel, Kennedy Klagge, who appeared telephonically. The statutory hearing was held from 1:34 p.m. to 1:40 p.m. pursuant to A.R.S. § 13-3994(H). ASH recommended revocation of conditional release.

James Holmes stated that Mr. Martell has undergone medication changes since the mental health report was written.

Ms. Klagge stated that Mr. Martell disagrees with subsections E, G, J, and L of the mental health report. Discussion was held among Board members and ASH staff regarding what constitutes patient rule violations at ASH on the secure inpatient units, and the Board requested information that explains what rules ASH patients are required follow. Louis Caputo, ASH’s attorney, stated that he would find out.

A motion was made by Chandrika Shankar to revoke the conditional release for Christopher Martell based on the evidence presented by the ASH treatment team that Mr. Martell failed to comply the terms of his conditional release, failed to prove by clear and convincing evidence that his is no longer dangerous, and that Christopher Martell remain at the Arizona State Hospital for further evaluation and treatment.
After discussion, Dr. Shankar amended her motion to include that Mr. Martell’s mental disease or defect has deteriorated. The amendment was seconded Susan Stevens, and it passed 3 – 0.

*Michael Klemens was not present for the vote.*

**Robert Allen Laber, Sr. – PSRB No. 13-12**

Robert Laber was present in person and through counsel, Kennedy Klagge, who appeared telephonically. The statutory hearing was held from 1:44 p.m. to 1:46 p.m. pursuant to A.R.S. § 13-3994(J). ASH recommended expiration with no further action.

Josh Fisher, Yavapai Deputy County Attorney, was teleconferenced into the hearing.

After discussion, a motion was made by Susan Stevens, seconded by Chandrika Shankar, and passed 3 – 0 to allow its jurisdiction over Robert Laber to expire without ordering the Yavapai County Attorney to initiate civil commitment proceedings based on the evidence presented, and to allow the Arizona State Hospital’s treatment team to conditionally release Robert Laber to a residential setting in the community up to five business days prior to the PSRB’s jurisdiction expiration date.

**Barbara Downey LeBourdais – PSRB No. 99-17**

Barbara LeBourdais was present in person and through counsel, Stefanie Jones-Campbell. The statutory hearing was held from 1:47 p.m. to 2:18 p.m. pursuant to A.R.S. § 13-3994(H). Ms. LeBourdais requested permission to travel out of state and for her grandchildren to stay with her during the summer.

Ms. Jones-Campbell stated that Ms. LeBourdais will notify the Board of actual travel dates when the travel plans are finalized and is looking forward to having her grandchildren for the summer.

It was clarified that the children are one, three, and seven years old and that Ms. LeBourdais has frequent contact with the children. Ms. LeBourdais commented that her mother is stable, and is watching her nieces this summer, so all the grandkids will be together for the summer.

Sarah Swonder, case manager, was sworn in and testified as to what services Ms. LeBourdais is eligible to receive. Discussion was held about Ms. LeBourdais employment and plans to begin peer support training.
A motion was made by James Clark, seconded by Susan Stevens, and passed 3 – 0 to recess into executive session at 1:53 p.m. to obtain legal advice pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.03(A)(3).

After discussion in executive session, the Board reconvened in open session at 2:04 p.m.

In open session, Dr. Clark asked Ms. LeBourdais if her home is stable. Ms. LeBourdais explained that her husband had begun drinking and she asked him to leave. He is now back home, has a year sober, is stable, and things are good.

Dr. Clark explained to Ms. LeBourdais that it is difficult for the Board to approve her grandchildren living with her for the summer because of her index crime. Ms. Jones-Campbell reminded the Board of Ms. LeBourdais’ long-standing stability in the community. Dr. Clark stated that he believes that a high-bar needs to be set considering the severity of the index time. Ms. LeBourdais informed the Board that she raised her son after she discharged from ASH in 2003, watched her nephews numerous times over the years, and that nothing like the index crime will ever happen again.

Extensive discussion was held about the possibility of case management home visits during the summer.

After discussion, a motion was made by James Clark, seconded by Chandrika Shankar, and passed 2 – 1 to grant out-of-state travel, based on the evidence presented that Barbara remains in stable remission and not dangerous, but prohibit the grandchildren returning to Arizona under Ms. LeBourdais’ supervision for the summer.

Susan Stevens opposed the motion stating that this is a very difficult decision. Ms. Stevens recognizes how well Ms. LeBourdais is doing, but would prefer to see more support built into such a recommendation.

Michael Klemens abstained as he was not present for the entire discussion.

**Raul Armando Placencio – PSRB No. 12-02**

Raul Placencio was present in person and through counsel, Stefanie Jones-Campbell. The statutory hearing was held from 2:19 p.m. to 2:22 p.m. pursuant to A.R.S. § 13-3994(J). The outpatient treatment team recommended expiration with no further action.

After brief discussion, a motion was made by Susan Stevens, seconded by Michael Klemens, and passed 4 – 0 to allow its jurisdiction over Raul Placencio expire without ordering the
Pinal County Attorney to initiate civil commitment proceedings based on the evidence presented by the outpatient treatment team.

**James Webb Norton – PSRB No. 17-14**

James Norton was present in person and through counsel, Benjamin Brewer, who appeared telephonically. The statutory hearing was held from 2:23 p.m. to 2:40 p.m. pursuant to A.R.S. § 13-3994(F). This was an initial hearing continued from last month and ASH recommended discharge.

Benjamin Brewer, Greg Norton, and Joe Young, were teleconferenced into the hearing.

Dr. Clark reviewed the Board’s options to discharge an individual from ASH. Dr. Morris explained that his recommendation to discharge Mr. Norton from ASH is based on his treatment team’s opinion that Mr. Norton is stable in terms of his psychiatric disorder, but he remains dangerous and at risk for re-offending. The treatment team, at the time of the report, had hoped that a locked facility where he could receive treatment for sexual offending would be an option, or that he could be transferred to the Arizona Department of Corrections, but it appears that neither of those options are possible. Dr. Morris added that the team explored the possibility of transferring Mr. Norton to Arizona Community Protection and Treatment Center (ACPTC), which is also not possible.

Mr. Caputo explained to the Board that ACPTC is a locked facility to treat violent sex offenders located on the same campus as ASH, which is the only facility of its kind in Arizona. However, Mr. Norton was not adjudicated as sexually violent and transfer to ACPTC is not possible.

Dr. Clark referred Dr. Morris to Donna Robinson’s independent evaluation of Mr. Norton. She identified 14 treatment intervention recommendations. Dr. Morris and Dr. Clark agreed that it appears that Mr. Norton will have to stay at ASH. Mr. Caputo added that ASH has and will continue to explore its legal options and clarified that ASH is not recommending conditional release.

Benjamin Brewer, defense counsel, stated that the primary concern is that both evaluations of Mr. Norton indicate a high risk to re-offend unless he is closely monitored in a secure facility and kept away from children, and he argued that Mr. Norton should only go to a setting that can guarantee no interaction with children.
Joe Young, Apache Deputy County Attorney, requested on behalf of the family of the victim, that the State ask the Board keep Mr. Norton confined, and reiterated Mr. Norton’s potential to re-offend.

A motion was made by James Clark, seconded by Susan Stevens, and passed 4 - 0 to deny discharge for James Norton based on the evidence presented by the Arizona State Hospital’s treatment team, that Mr. Norton did not prove by clear and convincing evidence that he no longer suffers from a mental disease or defect, that the mental disease or defect is in stable remission and that he is no longer dangerous. James Norton shall remain committed to the Arizona State Hospital.

Michael Anthony Allen – PSRB No. 13-03
Michael Allen was present in person and through counsel, Ray Hanna, who appeared on behalf of assigned attorney, Jerry Hernandez. The statutory hearing was held from 2:41 p.m. to 2:47 p.m. pursuant to A.R.S. § 13-3994(H). ASH recommended conditional release, phase three, levels five and six.

Joshua Davis, Yuma Deputy County Attorney, was teleconferenced into the hearing.

Mr. Hanna urged the Board to follow the recommendation. Mr. Allen stated that he is interested in attending Refrigeration School, and plans to tour the campus upon approval of increased levels today.

After discussion, motion was made by James Clark, seconded by Michael Klemens, and passed 4 – 0 to approve Michael Allen for conditional release to Arizona State Hospital, phase three, levels five and six, and amend the conditional release treatment plan to require that 180 days on level five must elapse prior to consideration for level six, based on the evidence presented by the Arizona State Hospital’s treatment team, that Mr. Allen’s mental disease or defect is in stable remission and he is not dangerous if he remains a resident of the State Hospital and is compliant with the terms of conditional release and the treatment plan amended today.

Christopher Shane Fortier – PSRB No. 15-05A
Christopher Fortier was present in person and through counsel, John W. Blischak. The statutory hearing was held from 2:48 p.m. to 2:51 p.m. pursuant to A.R.S. § 13-3994(H). ASH recommended modifications to the list of approved pass supervisors

Dr. Clark explained that ASH wants to add the STAR program to the list of approved pass supervisors. Dr. Klemens said he would find it helpful if the reports included reasons for
recommended pass supervisor changes. Dr. Schneider said she would include that in the future.

Mr. Blischak urged the Board to favorably consider the proposed changes.

A motion was made by James Clark, seconded by Michael Klemens, and passed 4 – 0 to approve the recommendation and add the STAR program to the list of approved pass supervisors, based on the evidence presented by the ASH treatment that that Mr. Fortier remains in stable remission and not dangerous.

**Vicky Dulcine Gee – PSRB No. 08-10**

Vicky Gee was present in person and through counsel, Tammy Wray. The statutory hearing was held from 2:52 p.m. to 3:30 p.m. pursuant to A.R.S. § 13-3994(H). ASH recommended conditional release to the Hospital, phase two, level four, and a modification to the list of approved pass supervisors.

Emmanuel Lee, Jr. was teleconferenced into the hearing.

Ms. Wray stated that Ms. Gee continues to do well and progress toward community release.

Danette Cox, surviving victim, testified that it is obvious that Ms. Gee is progressing toward discharge from ASH, and wanted to know what the surviving victims’ rights are. She realizes that Ms. Gee continues to use passes off the grounds of the State Hospital with Ms. Gee’s son, Emmanuel, and that the likelihood of having chance meetings with other family members, who have no wish to have contact with Ms. Gee, will increase. Ms. Cox suggested that Ms. Gee should continue to wear a GPS ankle monitoring device after discharge that excludes her from being in certain areas of the city.

Dr. Clark explained the process by which a person is conditionally release, which includes residential and case management monitoring, but upon discharge, the person is no longer affixed with a GPS device. Extensive discussion ensued.

Mr. Lee was sworn in and said when on a pass, his mother is under his care and does not leave his sight. He is aware of where other family members live and they avoid those areas. He added that ASH surveillance staff document their planned whereabouts prior to leaving the Hospital. He added that community release is not being recommended and urged all participants to focus on the current recommendation.
Cheryl Robinson, surviving victim, was sworn in and testified that her family has been dealing with Ms. Gee’s mental illness for 30 years; long before their mother was killed. She described years of medication non-compliance and drug abuse over that time. She added that Ms. Gee’s other son is being treated in a medical facility and that other family members may cross paths with Ms. Gee when visiting him there.

Josephine Jones, Maricopa Deputy County Attorney, stated that the State opposes any overnight passes. Medication compliance is particularly important in this case, as Ms. Gee was medication non-compliant when the index offense was committed. Ms. Jones pointed out that there was no medication compliance plan included in the recommendation from ASH treatment team and further stated that the proposed treatment plan lacks a psychiatrist’s signature, and thus, the Board does not have enough information to make a fully informed decision.

Dr. Schneider stated she regularly consults with not only Ms. Gee’s psychiatrist, Laxman Patel, but the entire multi-disciplinary team. Ms. Jones pointed out that it does not make sense that the psychiatrist is consulted but his signature does not appear on the proposed treatment plan, as all other multi-disciplinary team members’ signatures do. Dr. Clark commented that he would find value in the psychiatrist’s signatures being added to materials submitted the Board. Extensive discussion ensued.

Discussion was held about approving a surveillance “grid”, which is a preprogrammed area and path of travel specific to the individual’s GPS ankle monitor to allow the person to be monitored when they are off the grounds of ASH. Dr. Schneider stated that an exclusionary zone around a specific area can be established to address the victims’ concerns. Mr. Caputo pointed out that the specific addresses of the victims would have to be known to the surveillance team. Ms. Wray added that Ms. Gee would also have to know the addresses of the victims in order to avoid them. Extensive discussion ensued.

Dr. Schneider clarified that the medication monitoring plan on a 48-hour pass would be self-monitored administration.

After discussion, a motion was made by Susan Stevens, seconded by James Clark, and passed 4 – 0 to modify the terms of conditional release to include the STAR program, and to leave the other conditions as they are, based on the evidence presented that Ms. Gee remains in stable remission and no longer dangerous.

Ms. Wray asked the Board what they would like to see from Ms. Gee in order for her to progress. Dr. Clark stated that he wants Ms. Gee to continue the good work she is doing. He
added that he took into account the State’s and victims’ positions, and the seriousness of the index crime when casting his vote. Dr. Shankar commented that clarification of the approved boundaries in which Ms. Gee could travel outside of ASH would be helpful in the future.

Discussion was held about oral vs. injectable medications. Dr. Schneider stated that Ms. Gee was taken off injectable and switched to oral meds because she was agreeable to oral meds, and that Ms. Gee would resume injectable meds closer to discharge. Dr. Clark commented that this issue has come up numerous times in the past, and some prescribers have stated the same and it didn’t happen. Ms. Stevens reiterated that the Board’s mandate is public safety and protection, and she would feel better about a reduction in supervision over Ms. Gee if she was on an injectable medication.

The Board took a break from 3:31 p.m. to 3:37 p.m.

Rick William Stevenson – PSRB No. 95-06
Rick Stevenson was present in person and through counsel, Tammy Wray. The statutory hearing was held from 3:38 p.m. to 3:42 p.m. pursuant to A.R.S. § 13-3994(H). ASH recommended modifications to the list of approved pass supervisors.

Caleb and Aliyah Marsh were teleconferenced into the hearing.

After brief discussion, a motion was made by Michael Klemens, seconded by Susan Stevens, and passed 4 – 0 to approve the recommended modifications to the list of approved pass supervisors, based on the evidence presented that Rick Stevenson remains in stable remission and is not dangerous if he remains on levels three and four.

Ricardo Alejandro Ramirez – PSRB No. 17-08
Ricardo Ramirez was present in person and through counsel, Tammy Wray. The statutory hearing was held from 1:40 p.m. to 1:43 p.m. pursuant to A.R.S. § 13-3994(F). This was an initial hearing and there was no recommendation at that time.

Ms. Wray stated that Mr. Ramirez is participatory in treatment and therapy groups.

Dr. Klemens asked Dr. Holmes for clarification as to why the report states that there were no rule violations, and yet there is a listing of behaviors that he (Dr. Klemens) thinks would be considered as rule violations. Dr. Holmes said that although there were no official violations of Hospital rules, there were several noteworthy behaviors he wanted to include in his report to the Board. Dr. Klemens asked if threatening Hospital staff was a rule violation, and Dr. Holmes said it is not.
A motion was made by Chandrika Shankar, seconded by Susan Stevens, and passed 4 – 0 to deny conditional release for Ricardo Ramirez based on the evidence presented by the Arizona State Hospital’s treatment team, that Mr. Ramirez did not prove by clear and convincing evidence that he no longer suffers from a mental disease or defect, that the mental disease or defect is in stable remission and that he is no longer dangerous. Ricardo Ramirez shall remain committed to the Arizona State Hospital.

Steven Fraser Clark – PSRB No. 17-14
Steven Clark was present in person and through counsel, Michael Penrod. The statutory hearing was held from 3:46 p.m. to 3:57 p.m. pursuant to A.R.S. § 13-3994(F). This was an initial hearing and there was no recommendation at that time.

Dr. Clark noted that the record indicates a long history of treatment non-compliance and medication discontinuation.

Michael Penrod, defense counsel, stated that Mr. Clark understands he has a condition and is working to manage it as well as he can, and wants to stay at ASH.

Ryan Clark, the victim’s son and Mr. Clark’s brother, testified on behalf of the family. Mr. Clark stated the family will receive notification right around Mother’s Day for the next 25 years asking them to face the man who killed their mother, who happens to be his brother. Mr. Clark provided a historical narrative of witnessing his brother’s first psychotic break, described his mother scrawling a prayer on the walls at the murder scene, and explained that the only respite their mother got was when Steven was confined in a psychiatric hospital for 72 hours. Mr. Clark reiterated that either one or all of the siblings will be present at each hearing held for Steven Clark.

A motion was made by Chandrika Shankar, seconded by Susan Steven, and passed 4 – 0 to deny conditional release for Steven Clark based on the evidence presented by the Arizona State Hospital’s treatment team, that Mr. Clark did not prove by clear and convincing evidence that he no longer suffers from a mental disease or defect, that the mental disease or defect is in stable remission and that he is no longer dangerous. Steven Clark shall remain committed to the Arizona State Hospital.

Discussion and Possible Action Related to:
Review of draft policies in response to the Auditor General’s findings:
Mental Health Reports
Risk Assessments
Setting Hearings

Definitions

Dr. Clark stated that he participated in a telephonic meeting with Ms. Shapiro, her supervisor at ADHS, Tom Salow, and Thomas Raine; because there have been many opinions as to whether the Board should adopt rules, policies, or substantive policy statements (SPS). Mr. Raine discussed the Governor’s rule-making moratorium and advised that an SPS carries no force of law, but rather the agency’s interpretation of statutes or rules. Mr. Raine opined that most of the draft language could be accomplished with an SPS, with the exception of the requirements for the mental health reports which, if the PSRB wants ASH to respond to each and every question listed, should be in rule. He added that Ms. Shapiro’s supervisor suggested that the mental health report requirements could be in an SPS but is dependent on the Hospital’s cooperation. Mr. Raine disagrees with Mr. Salow’s opinion that all of the drafts should be an internal policy document, because most of it deals with how the PSRB interfaces with the public and not with administrative processes.

Mr. Caputo iterated that ASH wants to give the information to the Board that the Board needs to make informed decisions.

The Board members decided to continue to re-draft the documents to move things along.

The Board’s draft response to the six-month follow-up to the Auditor General’s report:

Dr. Clark reviewed the draft response to the Auditor General. Mr. Raine added that he would be giving the Board a memo with regard to recommendation three.

Discussion, Amendment and Approval of Minutes:

Open session minutes from the March 29, 2019, meeting:

A motion was made by James Clark, seconded by Michael Klemens, and passed 3 – 0 to approve the draft minutes, as amended.

Susan Stevens abstained.

Executive session minutes from the March 29, 2019, meeting:

A motion was made by James Clark, seconded by Michael Klemens, and passed 3 – 0 to approve the draft minutes, as amended.

Susan Stevens abstained.

Open session minutes from the April 16, 2019, meeting:

A motion was made by James Clark, seconded by Susan Stevens, and passed 4 – 0 to approve the draft minutes, as amended.
Executive session minutes from the April 16, 2019, meeting:
A motion was made by James Clark, seconded by Michael Klemens, and passed 4 – 0 to approve the draft minutes, as amended.

Open session minutes from the April 26, 2019, meeting:
A motion was made by Michael Klemens, seconded by Susan Stevens, and passed 3 – 0 to approve the draft minutes, as amended.

James Clark abstained.

Executive session minutes from the April 26, 2019, meeting:
A motion was made by Michael Klemens, seconded by Susan Stevens, and passed 3 – 0 to approve the draft minutes, as amended.

James Clark abstained.

Adjournment:
The Board meeting adjourned 4:23 p.m.